

Implementing High Quality Supermarkets Through Community Organizing and Public Health

OVERVIEW

Brief description of LHD- location, demographics of population served in your community.

The Cuyahoga County Board of Health (CCBH) is located in the Greater Cleveland area and serves 854,000 residents in 57 communities. The population it serves is 64% white, 30% African-American, 5% Hispanic and 3% Asian. The overall poverty rate in Cuyahoga County is 18.5% compared to 11% for whites, 31% for African Americans and 37% for Hispanics.

The City of Euclid is one of the largest cities in the Cuyahoga County Board of Health's jurisdiction with 48,313 residents. The city is majority African American at 59%, and 39% white, with 20% of the population living below the federal poverty level.

Public health issue: Ward 3 in Euclid, OH was considered a "food desert" characterized by higher rates of poverty and less access to supermarkets. This neighborhood has the lowest income levels in the city and experiences worse health outcomes compared to Cuyahoga County as a whole.

Goals and objectives of the proposed practice:

- Introduce a high quality supermarket that can succeed in a low-income neighborhood in Euclid, OH
- Build a coalition among local and regional governments, residents, store owner and funders
- Engage in broad community organizing strategies to hear resident concerns and recommendations and move people into collective action
- Hold storeowner accountable and responsive to stakeholder interests
- Demonstrate that high quality supermarkets can thrive in low-income neighborhoods
- Replicate model in other low income neighborhoods

How was the practice implemented: The Cuyahoga County Board of Health's Creating Healthy Communities (CHC) Program coordinated the opening of a full service supermarket with strong participation of Euclid residents. CHC staff wrote a grant and secured statewide funds and worked with Euclid leadership to pass legislation for funding to cover funding gaps needed to implement the store. CCBH coordinated three public forums and one grand opening event to develop broad community participation in the process, and to set accountability expectations for the store owner. Over 500 Euclid residents participated in these events.

Results/Outcomes (list process milestones and intended/actual outcomes and impacts.

- Successfully implemented and stabilized a full service supermarket
- Secured \$650,000 in funding from the Healthy Food for Ohio Program
- Passed legislation to secure \$125,000 from the City of Euclid's HUD-funded storefront renovation program
- Organized Ward 3 supermarket feedback forum at Imani Church with participation from 70 Euclid residents
- Organized supermarket feedback forum at the Euclid Hill Villa Senior Living Facility located across the street from the store with turnout from 80 residents
- Organized resident forum at the Simon's Supermarket location with participation by 120 residents. Job applications were distributed and a tour of the store was provided to all
- Organized Grand Opening event attracting over 230 people, strong media coverage
- Created over 50 jobs, mostly local hires
- Generated total revenues of \$4.6 million including almost \$400,000 in fresh produce sales and \$1.6 million in fresh meat sales over the first 10 months of business
- Increased food access for 2559 residents and 1442 households in Euclid, OH who were previously living in a food desert
- Expanded supermarket implementation model to one additional low income neighborhood in the City of Cleveland and helped to secure \$2.3 million from the City of Cleveland and the Healthy Food for Ohio Program for project

Were all of the objectives met?

Yes.

What specific factors led to the success of this practice?

- The strong community organizing and coalition building focus of this project was fundamental to its success. This was possible because of the almost full time staff capacity provided by the Cuyahoga County Board of Health's CHC program
- Transparent and direct dialogue fostered through the community forums helped to address initial cynicism and mistrust from a low-income community that has experienced disinvestment. The dialogue was important to build trust among a

largely African American community, Pakistani storeowner and local and regional government

- Statewide funding through the Healthy Food for Ohio Program and local funding from the City of Euclid
- Pro-active local City leadership
- Storeowner that valued and acted on feedback from residents

Public Health impact of practice

This practice increased access to a high quality supermarket for over 2500 Euclid residents who were previously living in a food desert. Over fifty jobs were created in a majority African-American community. Further economic development has occurred around the supermarket as evidenced increased business occupancy in the plaza that houses the supermarket.

Website for your program, or LHD.

<http://www.ccbh.net/cuyahoga-county-supermarket-assessment/>

RESPONSIVENESS AND INNOVATION

Statement of the problem/public health issue

A recent study by the United States Department of Agriculture found that almost 30 million Americans live in communities that lack access to supermarkets. Low-income communities and communities of color are disproportionately affected by this issue. In Cuyahoga County, food deserts are concentrated in the urban core and inner ring suburbs. This lack of access disproportionately affects people of color and low-income residents.

What target population is affected by problem (please include relevant demographics)

County wide 456,000 residents or 36% of the population live more than ½ mile from a grocery store and live in a high poverty area while nearly 193,000 residents live over 1 mile from a grocery store. Nearly 230,000 persons living in food deserts are African-American- about 50% of the total population living in food deserts compared to 20% African-American in non-food desert areas.

In the City of Euclid where this Supermarket Project was located 13,000 people were considered to be living in a food desert.

An analysis of Life Expectancy data (CCBH, 2013) found that one census tract in Euclid has the lowest life expectancy of any place in the county, over 20 years lower than the community with the highest life expectancy. This census tract is within one mile of Simon's Supermarket.

Many residents in this Euclid neighborhood are seniors and people of color and have limited incomes and lack of transportation

What is the target population size? What percentage did you reach?

The target population size in the City of Euclid is 13,000 which is the number of residents who are living in a food desert according to a 2012 County Board of Health analysis. The implementation of Simon's Supermarket increased access to a high quality supermarket for about 3,000 Euclid residents or 23% of the target population.

What has been done in the past to address the problem?

In 2013, a Health Impact Assessment was performed on 6 census tracts along the Euclid Avenue corridor, within Euclid, OH in order to better understand resident perceptions and determine neighborhood priorities. Two of the top priorities identified were: 1. Access to healthy and affordable food 2. Access to jobs. This health impact assessment helped to inform the Supermarket Implementation project.

Why is the current/proposed practice better?

The proposed practice addresses a broadly felt resident priority through collective engagement and coalition building. Without the support from community residents, government, and storeowner, a high quality supermarket would not exist in this Euclid neighborhood. This model makes the case that high quality supermarkets can thrive in low-income neighborhoods as long as the store owner is willing to meaningfully listen and act on resident feedback. This can create win, win, win outcomes for residents, supermarkets (increased revenue) as well as political leaders who want to address the priorities of their constituents. Supermarkets provide jobs, increased economic activity (they are often anchor businesses that attract other businesses to an area or plaza), and quality of life. This proposed practice makes the case that high quality supermarkets can succeed in low income neighborhoods and that LHD's have an important role in this process.

Is current practice innovative? How so/explain?

This practice is innovative because a Regional Health Department coordinated a multi-sector coalition to implement a full service supermarket. The LHD built a community movement around the introduction of the store. The practice used community

organizing principles to increase store stability and meet resident priorities. So far, this supermarket is succeeding in the exact location that other supermarkets have failed. The County Health department secured \$775,000 to fill a critical project gap which allowed for high quality infrastructure and materials for the project.

Residents had never before been asked their opinion regarding the implementation or operation of a supermarket. The supermarket became the “community’s supermarket.” This project aligned private business, public health, political power and community organizing to address resident priorities: food access, access to jobs.

Is it new to the field of public health

Yes. The proposed practice makes the case that strong community participation can create an environment wherein a high quality supermarket can succeed where others had failed.

Local Health Department and Community Collaboration and Implementation Strategy

Goal(s) and objectives of practice

- Introduce a high quality supermarket that can succeed in a low-income neighborhood in Euclid, OH
- Build a coalition among local and regional governments, residents, store owner and funders
- Engage in broad community organizing strategies to hear resident concerns and recommendations and move people into collective action
- Hold storeowner accountable and responsive to stakeholder interests
- Demonstrate that high quality supermarkets can thrive in low-income neighborhoods
- Replicate model in other low income neighborhoods
- Increase number of jobs and to hire locally to fill those jobs.
- Attract new businesses to plaza by establishing an anchor tenant

What did you do to achieve the goals and objectives?

The Cuyahoga County Board of Health’s Creating Healthy Communities (CHC) staff coordinated coalition development, led community organizing strategies, secured grant funding, coordinated media outreach and aligned city wide funding for the project. CHC led over 25 coalition strategy meetings with representation from key stakeholders including: storeowner, resident leaders, city council representative and the City of Euclid Planning Department. CHC coordinated three forums and one grand opening event with participation from over 500 Euclid residents. CHC compiled qualitative feedback from forums, analyzed for themes and shared with the storeowners and other stakeholders. CHC followed up with the storeowner to ensure that resident recommendations were acted on whenever possible. CHC coordinated earned media efforts related to the

Simon's Supermarket project resulting in significant local and regional coverage in print, video, online newspapers, radio and social media engagement through Twitter and Facebook. CHC secured \$775,000 in flexible capital through grant writing and passage of local legislation. A breakdown of the financial support secured for the project is below:

\$250,000 grant from the HFFO program

\$400,000 loan from the HFFO program

\$125,000 from the City of Euclid's HUD funded storefront renovation program

Amidst the success of the Simon's Supermarket project in Euclid, OH a major supermarket closed in the Buckeye neighborhood in the City of Cleveland. CHC connected City of Cleveland leadership with Simon's Supermarket and the HFFO Program. Simon's Supermarket is implementing a full service supermarket in this location with \$2.3 million in financial support from the City of Cleveland and the HFFO program. CHC is working with Buckeye residents and the City of Cleveland to develop community organizing strategies for implementation in that neighborhood. The experience in Euclid is providing relevant insight for the implementation of the Buckeye store. Recently, a one year anniversary forum was held at Simon's Supermarket in Euclid and a key part of the event included participation from Buckeye residents who were able to ask direct questions of the storeowner and ask Euclid residents regarding their experience with the store so far.

Steps taken to implement the program

- December 2015 met with store owner to understand vision, values and business model and the gaps that were preventing store implementation
- Submitted Grant Application to Healthy Food For Ohio Program
- Worked with City of Euclid Mayor, Ward 3 City Councilperson and Euclid Planning Department to draft legislation for funding from Euclid's HUD-Funded Storefront Renovation Program to support supermarket project implementation
- Organized forum at Imani Church located across the street from supermarket site to introduce store project proposal to residents and to hear concerns, recommendations and reasons why the previous supermarket had failed at that site. 70 Residents participated
- Secured \$650,000 in flexible capital from the Healthy Food for Ohio Program for construction and store development costs (HFFO)
- Spoke at Euclid City Council Meeting in support of funding for the Supermarket Project, organized with residents to speak in support of legislation. City legislation passed to provide \$125,000 for supermarket

- Coordinated media work for project with significant print, video and online coverage
- Coordinated multi-sector supermarket coalition, organized 25 meetings
- Developed community organizing strategy
- Organized supermarket feedback forum at the Euclid Hill Villa Senior Living Facility located across the street from the store with turnout from 80 residents
- Organized resident forum at the Euclid Simon's Supermarket location with participation by 120 residents. Job applications were distributed and a tour of the store was provided to all
- Compiled and analyzed resident feedback for all events, provided to storeowner and city leadership
- February 2017 Organized Grand Opening event attracting over 230 people, strong media coverage and single day store revenue record of \$35,000
- December 2017 Organized 1 year anniversary Forum with participation from Euclid residents and from Buckeye residents, over 90 residents participated

Any criteria for who was selected to receive the practice (if applicable)?

- Supermarket project location must be located in a neighborhood considered a food desert, meaning less access to a full service supermarket and higher rates of poverty
- Supermarket should be a "good actor." This depends on a number of factors including: quality and relevance of fresh meat and produce offerings, prices, appearance of store, wages, local hiring policies, willingness to listen and act on resident feedback etc.

An important concept related to selecting candidates is to work with supermarkets that respect local communities. Based on this model practice, this is a critical factor that can stabilize high quality supermarkets in communities that have historically been oppressed.

What was the timeframe for the practice?

One year and two months for the Euclid Supermarket Project from initial engagement with the storeowner in December 2015 to the official Grand Opening of the store on February 4th 2017. However, the LHD's role is ongoing through hosting nutrition education tours of the store, and recently organizing a 1year anniversary resident feedback forum.

Were other stakeholders involved? What was their role in the planning and implementation process?

Taneika Hill, Euclid City Councilperson Ward 3

Simon Hussain, Owner of Simon's Supermarket

Mary Jones, Elected President of Euclid Hill Villa Senior Living Apartment

Kristen Holzheimer-Gail, Mayor of Euclid

Roger Sikes, Program Manager Cuyahoga County Board of Health, Creating Healthy Communities Program

Kandace Jones, Resident Euclid Ward 3

Brian Iorio, Community Development Manager, City of Euclid Planning Department

Omar El Hag Musa, MBA Lending Officer, Finance Fund (Healthy Food for Ohio Program)

Mary Jones is the elected Resident Council Leader of a 500+ unit senior living apartment building that is directly across the street from Simon's Supermarket. The Resident Council holds monthly meetings to address resident and community concerns, with participation from 60 to 100 residents each month. This was an important community organizing hub for the Simons Supermarket project. The existing organizational communication channels and importance of this supermarket for residents in this facility made Mary Jones' leadership role very important. Mary Jones would turn out 20-30 residents to Supermarket forums and was able to communicate with residents at their monthly meetings. Strong participation from Euclid Hill Villa residents demonstrated to City leadership and to the Healthy Food for Ohio Funder the urgency of this project.

Taneika Hill is the recently elected Ward 3 City Councilperson. Taneika participated in weekly strategy meetings with the store owner, County Board of Health CHC Program, and City of Euclid Planning Department. She communicated directly with her base to turn out residents for Supermarket events, often bringing 30 to 40 residents. Taneika helped to pass legislation for \$125,000 from the City's HUD-Funded Storefront Renovation Program. She advocated resident priorities and concerns to the store owner, CCBH and City of Euclid to make sure that her constituents were being heard throughout the process. It is notable that Taneika was very in touch with her base (constituents) and was able to quickly mobilize residents throughout the project.

Simon Hussain is the owner of Simon's Supermarket. Simon had long been interested in developing a supermarket in the Euclid location, however he did not have enough capital to jumpstart the project. Simon has experience in the local supermarket environment as he took over two failing supermarkets within the City of Cleveland and improved them into profitable and stable supermarkets. Notably, Simon's first two stores were "turn-key" projects that he took over halting their operations. The Euclid location was unique because he was developing the store from the ground up as it had been an abandoned storefront for years. Simon's main role was developing the physical location of the store, hiring contractors, designing the layout and making strategic

business decisions. Additionally, he was a key player in all of the community oriented strategy meetings. He participated in x2 large scale community forums to meet residents and answer questions and concerns. He opened up his store to host one of the forums prior to the Grand Opening and provided residents with healthy food refreshments and a sneak peak tour of the store. Simon distributed job applications and explained what the job application process was for residents.

Simon attended a Euclid City Council meeting with the County Board of Health to explain the Supermarket Project and to advocate for support from the City.

This project was Simon's first experience using a community organizing model to implement a supermarket. And it was his first experience with public speaking in a dynamic community environment. Simon understood the importance of listening to residents and acting on their priorities and concerns. And as a local storeowner he had the decision making power to implement changes and recommendations that he heard from community residents.

Kandace Jones is a community leader who lives in Ward 3 and has grandchildren who live and attend school in Ward 3. Kandace has been involved in health equity work in Euclid for years. She attended Euclid City Council meetings along with Euclid residents to advocate for the supermarket in this neighborhood. She was interviewed by the Funder (Healthy Food for Ohio Program) as they were trying to discern whether this project would fulfill a pressing community need. Kandace provided historical knowledge of the neighborhood and the previous supermarket and she also helped to turn out Euclid residents to supermarket events.

Mayor Kirsten Holzheimer-Gail participated in the community forum held at Simon's Supermarket and understood the importance of this supermarket project from a health equity perspective and a business perspective. She communicated the importance of this project to Euclid City Council and City leadership and ultimately passed legislation for funding support for the project. Mayor Gail's presence at forums and events demonstrated that resident concerns in Ward 3 were important to the city and that the project had the city's full support.

Brian Iorio attended weekly strategy meetings for the Project. Brian was the link between residents, physical store development and the City of Euclid government. Brian made sure that the City of Euclid was aware and aligned with the community organizing strategies. For example, the City of Euclid's website would note events related to the Supermarket Project, the City of Euclid provided a stage for the Grand Opening event and Brian was instrumental in securing the HUD-Funded Storefront Renovation Grant.

Omar El Haj Musa is the lending officer for the Finance Fund and managed the financial processes of the Healthy Food for Ohio Program (HFFO). HFFO ultimately provided \$650,000 in flexible capital for the project. Omar attended a Euclid Community Forum event to communicate to residents about the Healthy Food for Ohio Program and also

heard first hand from Euclid residents what they wanted to see in a full service supermarket.

The \$650,000 funding from the HFFO program helped to leverage the \$125,000 from the City of Euclid while the funding commitment from Euclid helped to secure the funding from the HFFO program.

What does the LHD do to foster collaboration with community stakeholders? Describe the relationship(s) and how it furthers the practice goal(s)

The CHC program used community organizing principles of reciprocity and respect for local knowledge and leadership throughout the project. The LHD centered Euclid residents and the City Council Representative when making strategic decisions related to the Project. Residents participated in the smaller strategy meetings and played leadership roles in the larger forums. Representative stakeholders were included in almost every coalition meeting. This input was necessary to make decisions throughout the project that included the perspectives of residents who would be affected by the supermarket. And more importantly, transparency and dialogue built strong relationships among residents, local government, the storeowner and the LHD. This trust and collaboration was fundamental to the projects success.

Any start up or in-kind costs and funding services associated with this practice? Please provide actual data, if possible. Otherwise, provide an estimate of start-up costs/ budget breakdown.

One full time community organizer is strongly recommended to successfully implement this practice. In this case, the County Board of Health Creating Healthy Communities Program Manager Staff filled this role. For the first 8 months of the project one full time Program Manager spent approximately 50% of their time on the project. For the last 6 months through the Grand Opening of the supermarket the Program Manager spend approximately 80% of their time on the project.

The Healthy Food for Ohio Program funding was critical to the success of the project for the following reasons:

- 1) Store owner was unable to complete high quality store implementation without funding support
- 2) HFFO funding helped to leverage support from Euclid City Council and the Mayor to provide local funding for the project.
- 3) HFFO funding along with strong community participation created accountability measures for the store owner to ensure the store was high quality and reflected the feedback from local residents

City of Euclid's HUD Funded Storefront Renovation Program was critical to the success of the project for the following reasons:

- 1) Store owner was unable to complete high quality store implementation without

funding support

2) Strong local City Government support helped to demonstrate to state level funder (HFFO) that this project was collaborative and could succeed

3) Local funding opportunity provided an advocacy and mobilization opportunity for local residents. Their strong participation in forums and showing up to Euclid City Council meetings demonstrated urgency for the project to city leadership and was a clearly felt shared participatory victory for local residents

Funding breakdown:

\$60,000 for Community Organizing staff provided by the Cuyahoga County Board of Health's Creating Healthy Communities Program (approximate salary and benefits for 1.2 year period at 40% for the first 8 months and 80% for 6 months)

\$250,000 grant from the HFFO program for costs related to store implementation

\$400,000 loan from the HFFO program for costs related to store implementation

\$125,000 grant from the City of Euclid's HUD funded storefront renovation program

\$650,000 from the storeowner for costs related to store implementation

Concepts related to the budget are:

1) Funding leverage to hold store owner accountable to resident feedback and high quality standards

2) Full time community organizing capacity is fundamental to the success of this practice. Resident participation is critical, particularly in neighborhoods that have experienced oppression and disinvestment. The community organizer's role is to set up win, win situations where resident feedback is heard and acted upon by the store owner and city Leadership while business revenues are stabilized through strong community buy in for the store.

EVALUATION

The project demonstrated that a high quality supermarket can succeed in a low-income neighborhood when community organizing, resident participation and coalition building are prioritized. This was made possible through a full time staff person dedicated to these tasks alongside the actual development of a physical supermarket. All of the stated objectives were achieved (listed below). However, the success of the incoming supermarket in Buckeye remains to be seen and will be an important test of the practice. The success or failure of the Buckeye store has implications for additional supermarket projects in other low-income neighborhoods in Cuyahoga County and beyond.

Goals and objectives of the proposed practice:

- Introduce a high quality supermarket that can succeed in a low-income neighborhood in Euclid, OH
- Build a coalition among local and regional governments, residents, store owner and funders
- Engage in broad community organizing strategies to hear resident concerns and recommendations and move people into collective action
- Hold storeowner accountable and responsive to stakeholder interests
- Demonstrate that high quality supermarkets can thrive in low-income neighborhoods
- Replicate model in other low income neighborhoods

Primary Data Sources:

-Monthly revenue and expense reports for Simon's Supermarket from 12/19/16 to 10/31/17 were collected by CHC staff. The availability of this financial information is notable because supermarkets are often unwilling to share detailed financial information in fear of being put at a competitive disadvantage. Again, the trust built with the storeowner made this data available to be analyzed.

-According to the storeowner - who has 14 years of experience operating supermarkets in Cuyahoga County - revenues at the Euclid location have been very strong. The owner did not anticipate these levels of revenue until his third year of operations.

-Qualitative data was collected during public forums and analyzed for themes. This data was used to inform store operations, products and hiring at Simon's Supermarket. This data was collected by CHC staff during the public forums and was recorded on site on flip chart paper. Later this data was transcribed into Microsoft Excel. In addition 72 written feedback forms were collected at supermarket events and then transcribed into Microsoft Excel. A sampling of questions, answers and recommendations is included below:

"The storeowner should make sure his wine doesn't look better than his fruit"

"The store owner should make sure that workers greet shoppers and treat them with respect"

"I want a job, will you hire me?"

"He should make sure there is better lighting in the parking lot"

Themes that emerged through qualitative data analysis included:

"Safety"

"High quality and affordable meats and specific cuts" (pointing to the importance of butchers always being on site)

"Local hiring" and employees that "greet and treat residents well"

"Clean and organized store"

"Invest in the community" and we will invest in you... "show us"

"Affordability, affordability, affordability" alongside "quality" of fresh produce and lots

of selection for “greens”
“Stay consistent”

Performance measures:

The number of residents that participated in events related to the Supermarket Project. The strong resident turnout in the initial supermarket events clarified the importance of the project to the LHD. This strong resident turnout alongside known health disparities data in this neighborhood helped to make this project a priority for the LHD.

Passing City wide legislation for funding for the project was an indicator for the level of local support in the city of Euclid, particularly gauging support from City Council representatives in wards that were not receiving funds for a supermarket. The legislation passed with unanimous support from all 9 Euclid City Council members.

A successful grant application from the Healthy Food for Ohio (HFFO) Program was an important process performance measure. HFFO used the following metrics to determine whether or not to fund a supermarket project including:

Is the proposed location considered a food desert?

The storeowner must provide a yearly report for the next five years with information including:

- Number of full time and part time jobs created and the number sustained
- Number of sales, total amount of sales , % of transactions that constituted SNAP sales
- Square footage created for healthy food retail and square footage sustained

The following changes have been made to Simon’s Supermarket based on resident feedback and are also performance measures:

- Full time butcher on site during all hours that the supermarket is open
- Four automatic carts were made available at the store for people who have difficulties walking
- Transportation back home is provided to shoppers. They ask for at least \$75.00 to be spent for this service; however they make an effort provide a ride home to anyone who needs it
- Addressed storm water drainage issues that were causing flooding in the yards of adjacent residential properties stemming from run off of the supermarket parking lot. A new break wall and fencing was installed
- Increased lighting under the front canopy of the store
- Local hiring during supermarket events

SUSTAINABILITY

Lessons learned in relation to practice

-High quality supermarkets can succeed in low-income neighborhoods. However, it is critical that local residents are respected and engaged directly in the process, particularly in communities that have historically been oppressed.

-The store owner must be willing to “meet residents where they are,” listen to residents and act in good faith on resident priorities. It may not be feasible to implement all of the changes that residents wish to see but the store owner should be open and communicative what her plans are and what she can or cannot complete. Communities that experience systemic racism, poverty and general disinvestment are understandably wary of outside investors and or promises for change.

-The quality, affordability, relevance of store inventory and aesthetics of the supermarket are important. Residents in lower income neighborhoods are more likely to have experienced low quality supermarkets, price gouging or issues with expired meats and produce. Therefore to build trust and “buy in” among residents the store owner should invest in high quality infrastructure (coolers, tiles, store layout, quality of fresh meats and produce, respectfulness of employees, etc.) and for the residents to see this clearly. If a store owner can win the trust and respect of residents, this can contribute to the store’s stability and revenues.

-Residents asserted their desire to support African-American owned supermarkets. In the case in Euclid, the owner of Simon’s Supermarket is a Pakistani immigrant. This project has been successful because residents developed trust and accountability with the store owner through an intentional campaign. However, the importance of a “black-owned” supermarket cannot be overstated. From a social determinants of health perspective, building wealth in African-American Communities is fundamental to reduce health disparities. In addition, there is a strong business case for store ownership by someone who reflects the make-up of the community in which the store operates. Residents expressed preference to shop at a store owned by someone that they could relate to and that offered a high-quality supermarket experience. In future supermarket implementation, policies and or funding that prioritizes ownership by residents who reflect the community – in this case African American – should be considered.

Lessons learned in relation to partner collaboration (if applicable)

-A thorough community organizing process requires at least one full time staff person. The community organizing cannot be an afterthought, or be placed on volunteers or staff that do not have the time to focus on coalition building and community organizing. In this case, the community organizer worked at the LHD through the Creating Healthy Communities Program. The community organizer does not necessarily have to be housed within the LHD; however staff must be respected by local residents, or at least understand community organizing principles that center the perspectives of those who

are directly affected by the issue. It is not realistic for the store owner to both implement a full service supermarket and also lead community organizing and coalition building effort. The supermarket owner should be included in this process but should be given space to focus on the successful development of the store and business model – using feedback from residents.

-The issue of supermarkets can move local political leadership and broad groups of residents into action creating win, win, win situations. Intentional supermarket implementation strategies are opportunities for LHD's to build trust with communities and local political leadership that may not have had awareness of or positive perceptions of the LHD.

Did you do a cost/benefit analysis? If so, describe.

Costs to LHD:

Approximately \$60,000 over a 1.2 year period for staff time to coordinate this project including community organizing and coalition building

Benefits:

\$125,000 investment from the City of Euclid

\$650,000 in flexible capitol from HFFO

\$650,000 in investment from Storeowner

Development of a stable high quality supermarket

Creation of 50 local jobs

\$4.6 million in overall revenue over first 10 months including \$400,000 in fresh produce sales and \$1.6 million in fresh meat sales

Social capital developed with the City of Euclid leadership. This project demonstrated to City of Euclid leadership (a municipality that pays per capita rates for public health services from the LHD) the relevance and dynamism of strong collaboration with the County Health Department. These relationships have led to strong collaboration to pass and implement Tobacco 21 policies in Euclid.

Social capital developed with Euclid residents who in turn, inform elected political decision makers and through trust and partnership can help the LHD to continue relevant community engagement.

Extensive earned media coverage that highlighted the role that the LHD played in addressing a community priority.

\$2.3 million dollar investment in a new supermarket in a food desert neighborhood in

Cleveland's Buckeye neighborhood

All of this capitol and infrastructure investment was concentrated in a low-income neighborhood that experiences poor health outcomes.

Is there sufficient stakeholder commitment to sustain the practice?

Yes. The storeowner's revenues are strong after the first 10 months of operations. The Euclid coalition has evolved into a county wide Supermarket Coalition that continues to support the Euclid supermarket, most recently hosting a 1 year anniversary forum. Simon's Supermarket is actively expanding store locations into other food desert areas in Cuyahoga County using the model that was developed in Euclid, OH.

Describe sustainability plans

The supermarket organizing work in Euclid has evolved into a county wide coalition that is housed within the healthy the Healthy Eating Active Living (HEAL) subcommittee of an existing coalition called HIP-Cuyahoga (Health Improvement Partnership-Cuyahoga). HIP-Cuyahoga is a coalition of over 300 organizations and over 1000 individuals that seek to address the root causes of health disparities and whose core value is to build opportunities for everyone in Cuyahoga County to be healthy. The HIP Cuyahoga Supermarket coalition's goals are:

- 1) Support active supermarket projects in low-income areas in Cuyahoga County
- 2) Lead or support community organizing strategies alongside supermarket implementation
- 3) Advocate for policies to support high quality supermarket implementation and stabilization in low-income neighborhoods. This may include funding and accountability measures such as "clawbacks" to promote good actor supermarkets (local hiring, resident feedback requirements, local entrepreneurship opportunities, living wages, time commitments, produce commitments etc.)

The purpose of the evolution is to sustain and expand community organizing, and policy and active supermarket implementation efforts in low income areas by anchoring the work within a broader and more stable network.

Roger Sikes, MPH
Cuyahoga County Board of Health
Creating Healthy Communities Program
216-903-3283
rsikes@ccbh.com